

PASSAIC VALLEY WATER COMMISSION MEETING OF

DECEMBER 16, 2015

(OPEN SESSION)

C O M M I S S I O N E R S P R E S E N T :

CHRYSTAL A. CLEAVES, President

RIGO SANCHEZ, Vice President (Absent)

MENACHEM BAZIAN, Treasurer

THOMAS P. DeVITA, Secretary

GLORIA KOLODZIEJ

JEFFREY LEVINE

RUSSELL GRADDY

A L S O P R E S E N T :

JOSEPH A. BELLA, Executive Director

GEORGE T. HANLEY, Counsel

YAACOV BRISMAN, Assistant Counsel

JAMES G. DUPREY, Director of Engineering

YITZ WEISS, Comptroller

LOUIS AMODIO, Administrative Secretary

1 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: The meeting is now
2 called to order.

3 MR. AMODIO: On the roll.

4 Commissioner Sanchez is not here.

5

6 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
7 present respond in the affirmative)

8

9 MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

10 The time is 12:07.

11 All of the requirements of the Open Public
12 Meetings Act have been met. Notices have been
13 furnished to all Commissioners; City Clerks of
14 Paterson, Passaic, and Clifton; North Jersey
15 Herald News; The Record - Passaic County edition
16 and the Commission's Executive Staff with a copy
17 posted at the main bulletin board at the Clifton
18 facility.

19 Will you please rise.

20 Mr. Hanley.

21

22 (Pledge of Allegiance and Moment of
23 Silence for the victims of San Bernardino)

24

25 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Now we have public

1 comments.

2 Mario Agostinelli, would you like to
3 speak?

4 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Sure.

5 From right here?

6 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Yes, sir.

7 MR. AGOSTINELLI: I'm here over an issue
8 that took place in 2010 at my location at Second
9 Avenue. I own a machine shop there. It's a small
10 building; 6,000 square feet total.

11 The situation arose in 2010 where I
12 received an invoice from the Sewerage Department
13 from the City of Paterson which when I looked back
14 at my records, I said: Wait a minute, this
15 invoice is probably eight times higher than it
16 normally is. That arose my suspicion. I went
17 back to the old bills that I paid annually prior
18 to that and that's the conclusion I came to. It
19 was way out of control.

20 When I called them questioning them about
21 it, they said: Well, you should get your
22 consumption from the Passaic Valley Water
23 Commission for the past year because that's how
24 the billing takes place.

25 When I received your fax pertaining to the

1 consumption from 2009, midsummer I would guess
2 till mid 2010, I, you know, who looks at their
3 water meter or at their sewer. I normally just
4 pay that stuff without giving it a second thought,
5 but because the sewer bill was so high, I got into
6 it.

7 So you sent me a fax regarding that
8 consumption. I didn't even pay attention to it.
9 I looked at the numbers and I faxed it to the
10 Sewer Department in Paterson and they said: Don't
11 pay that bill, we're going to send you a new one.
12 And the new bill I received was about a third of
13 the original bill.

14 When I went down to pay the bill, I
15 questioned her. I said: Where did you get your
16 original information to give me this erroneous
17 bill to begin with, if that's the case. And they
18 said: Well, that's the paperwork they received in
19 a book that was on the counter from the Passaic
20 Valley Water Commission.

21 I would take it that I assume you send
22 Paterson a book that bills all the customers at
23 year's end for the past year's consumption. And
24 the fax I got from you in October weren't the
25 facts that were in that book.

1 So already there was a problem there that
2 I saw because I have a copy of both documents; one
3 that I got from the book that you already had sent
4 to the town, obviously. And one that came from
5 you several months later that indicated something
6 totally different.

7 When I got that bill, the first thing I
8 did was go look at the water meter and I go:
9 Something's wrong here because we don't use any
10 water. We wash our hands and go to the bathroom
11 on occasion. As far as, we don't run a sprinkler
12 system. There's no grass down there in Paterson
13 anyway.

14 So as I look at the meter, the meter
15 indicates probably in a five -- I mean, I have
16 every bill here that spells out what the meter
17 reads. So when I went to look at it, it kind of
18 jived with what I was seeing in your paperwork.
19 And since I looked at it now, of course, I'm
20 paying much more attention to what's happening
21 with the water in the building. I'm there
22 everyday. Machinists are notorious for fixing
23 things the minute they see something wrong. I'm
24 in there everyday. I said: There's no leaks. I
25 was just getting ahead. I thought once I paid the

1 new bill, everything was resolved.

2 A week goes by and I get a new bill from
3 your company stating that it was \$800 for three
4 months and so I was taken aback by it.

5 And this is where we are today. The bill
6 was never paid. It accumulated more charges, so I
7 haven't paid anything since midsummer of 2010.
8 And there were some penalties or whatever.

9 They showed up to remove the meter in 2012
10 which was probably two years later, yet, the meter
11 never budged after that. It was still the same
12 meter. When I went down and looked at the meter
13 later on it read like double the consumption from
14 the time the meter was installed in 2002, I used X
15 volume of water and the next three months I
16 doubled it. And I said: Well, how could that be.
17 I'm in the building everyday. That means that I
18 used eight years of water in three months. It's
19 not possible. And so either something was wrong
20 with the meter. I don't know what occurred. But
21 that reading shouldn't have been on that meter.

22 So I'm at a loss as to what occurred. I
23 thought we'd be able to settle this once and for
24 all today.

25 And, you know, for the next two years when

1 this problem came up, the meter never changed.
2 The number never changed on the meter. So the
3 next two years after that, the meter never turned.
4 I think it turned one, one number. It went to
5 one. So I'm very confused.

6 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Can I ask a
7 question?

8 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: You had a meeting with
9 legal here?

10 MR. AGOSTINELLI: We had an initial
11 meeting. I don't recall the exact timing, maybe
12 it was like the beginning of '11 or somewhere
13 around there or late 2010. And I think George
14 Hanley was present.

15 MR. HANLEY: I don't specifically recall
16 but Mr. Kelly tells me that we did.

17 Your company is Tricep?

18 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Yes.

19 MR. HANLEY: I do remember that name so
20 I'm sure you're accurate. You know, we have a lot
21 of these things.

22 John, did you want --

23 MR. KELLY: Mario came in on 11/17.

24 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: What year are we
25 talking about?

1 MR. KELLY: 2011; 11/7/2011. Yitz Weiss,
2 George Hanley, Jim Gallagher, Maria Malfa, Mark
3 Romaine, John Kelly all came to the meeting with
4 Mario.

5 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Wow, you had a lot
6 of people.

7 MR. AGOSTINELLI: These were all your
8 people. I felt like the Lone Ranger.

9 MR. KELLY: I was asked to investigate.
10 We received a letter from Mario on November 25th,
11 2010. We had a meeting and we received a letter
12 from his attorney on November 15th, 2011. So I
13 went and did everything. Pulled all the paperwork
14 out.

15 There's water usage on the meter. The
16 water went through the meter. How it went through
17 the meter, I don't know. The meter registered.

18 As of today, he owes the Commission
19 \$1,384.24. Actual water usage is \$1,140.76 if you
20 take the door tags and penalties off.

21 I explained to him the water went through
22 the meter. It's not our responsibility how the
23 water went through the meter. Somebody used the
24 water. It calculates.

25 Then no water went through the meter for

1 two years and it moved one quarter. Didn't go
2 again and now hasn't used water since 2012.

3 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Do you use any
4 water?

5 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Very little.

6 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: But you use water?

7 MR. AGOSTINELLI: To wash my hands.

8 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: You use a little bit
9 of water.

10 MR. AGOSTINELLI: You mean beyond --

11 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: He's saying no water
12 went through for two years. You don't use that
13 much water?

14 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Let me understand this
15 collectively. If in three months time the method
16 I was told to use for calculation, the meter reads
17 in cubic feet. To convert to gallons, I was told
18 to multiply the consumption, the number you see on
19 the bill times 100 times 7.48, there's 7.48
20 gallons. So when I did that math for that three
21 months, that calculated to 360,000 gallons of
22 water which would be 4,000 gallons a day.

23 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: In three months?

24 MR. AGOSTINELLI: I'm in the building
25 everyday and I mean, the only way I could see

1 something like that occurring, I mean, I thought I
2 turned out some numbers. I'm somewhat of an
3 engineer. I said I have to have a faucet
4 practically open for the entire 90 days.

5 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Was the meter
6 checked?

7 MR. KELLY: Getting back to your original
8 question. He said he shutdown for two years and
9 then came back. That's his option to open the
10 valve inside or out.

11 MR. AGOSTINELLI: How can I open the valve
12 when there's no meter there?

13 MR. KELLY: Back in 2010, there was a
14 meter.

15 Can I finish, Mario?

16 Consumption was used. How it was used, we
17 don't determine how you use consumption. And as
18 for the meter, you're talking seven years ago. It
19 already went through the system. We didn't get
20 nothing in writing until -- this goes back to
21 2010. The first letter we got in writing about
22 the water bill was November 2010 and then his
23 lawyer followed up and never followup again. And
24 he was shutoff and the meter taken off for
25 nonpayment.

1 He had told me at one time he was trying
2 to sell his property and the Finance Department in
3 Paterson got involved too.

4 I don't have to tell you the water went --

5 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: Was there a leak on
6 his --

7 MR. KELLY: Not on the property. If there
8 was a leak on our side, it wouldn't register.

9 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: I'm talking about on
10 his side.

11 MR. KELLY: Here's how it works. There's
12 a meter. It doesn't register the meter --

13 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: On the other side it
14 will register. Right?

15 MR. KELLY: It will register.

16 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: I don't think we're
17 going to resolve this issue right here, so I'm
18 going to ask you to meet with Mr. Mario again.

19 MR. KELLY: Can I just? We met before the
20 meeting and he doesn't want to pay the money.

21 MR. AGOSTINELLI: I'd like to say that
22 once you see the meter inside, there's a small
23 basement. It's a ten by ten. The water line
24 comes in. There's a meter. Everything beyond
25 that point is visible. There's nothing

1 underground. It comes out of the basement and it
2 goes to two bathrooms and a line that goes around
3 the bag but it terminates inside the building. It
4 doesn't go outside.

5 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: Where it starts from
6 the curb we're talking about.

7 MR. AGOSTINELLI: From the curb to the
8 meter.

9 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: Yeah.

10 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Like he said, if there
11 was a leak.

12 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: From the curb to
13 your building is your responsibility. But the
14 curb the other way, that's what I'm talking about.

15 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Like John said, if the
16 water didn't go through the meter, it wouldn't
17 register.

18 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Okay. Excuse me.

19 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Beyond the meter,
20 there's nothing on the ground.

21 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Excuse me. We're not
22 going to resolve this issue here now, so what I'm
23 going to ask Mr. Hanley to do is to submit to us
24 some sort of resolution as to what the
25 Commission's options are.

1 MR. HANLEY: Well, unless there are facts
2 that contradict the fact it went through the
3 meter, he's responsible for that water.

4 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Can we put this in
5 writing?

6 MR. HANLEY: If you want to make an
7 exception to that based on whatever reasons are
8 asserted, that would be a policy decision for the
9 Commission.

10 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Okay.

11 MR. HANLEY: We follow the rules that we
12 have in place here.

13 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Okay.

14 MR. AGOSTINELLI: If I may?

15 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: We just need --

16 MR. AGOSTINELLI: If I may? I would just
17 like to say: Let's install another meter. We'll
18 run it for a month and let's take a look at the
19 consumption.

20 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Excuse me, sir.
21 Excuse me, sir. That's one of the options that --

22 MR. HANLEY: Well, wait. You're proposing
23 that we put a new meter in and measure the reading
24 now?

25 MR. AGOSTINELLI: I guess, yes.

1 MR. HANLEY: Frankly, it's not relevant to
2 the issue.

3 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: This is not the place
4 to decide what needs to be done. You need to sit
5 down and have another discussion, a more thorough
6 discussion. You give your suggestions to them and
7 they give you -- you need to have this dialogue.
8 But right here right now is not the place to have
9 this dialogue. Okay. Set up a meeting. Okay.
10 Because you said you had one prior, it might have
11 been rushed. Have a more thorough meeting.

12 MR. AGOSTINELLI: Here?

13 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: With the Legal
14 Department.

15 MR. AGOSTINELLI: We could make that
16 argument that, you know, that the water went
17 through the meter, like John's proposing --

18 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Can you set up a
19 meeting with the Executive Director?

20 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Madam President, may
21 I ask one question, please? Were we reading the
22 meter every month?

23 MR. AMODIO: Every quarter.

24 MR. KELLY: Every quarter.

25 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Every quarter we

1 read the meter?

2 I don't know if another meter is going
3 to -- I think we should make a decision here and
4 move on.

5 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: I don't. I don't
6 have enough information. I need to have something
7 in writing and my options.

8 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: This is my first
9 hearing this.

10 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: First time came
11 before the Board?

12 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: To be fair to him.

13 MR. AMODIO: So you'll meet with Legal and
14 the Executive Director.

15 Thank you.

16 Next.

17 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Before you leave
18 today, make sure you schedule a time.

19 Mr. Bill Linteris.

20 MR. LINTERIS: Good afternoon. My name is
21 Bill Linteris representing Passaic County Board of
22 Realtors.

23 We would like to again followup with
24 Passaic Valley Water Commission on the findings
25 and results of the surveys and meetings performed

1 by the JGSC Group and the future plans for the
2 three reservoirs: Levine, New Street, and Great
3 Notch.

4 Also, if there have been any other ideas
5 or alternatives proposed for Levine Reservoir at
6 this time.

7 We would like to inquire if there has been
8 any progress with Newark on working out a joint
9 venture which may save Great Notch Reservoir from
10 being drained and concrete tanks being built.

11 And what the possible timelines and/or
12 schedules may be for future research, projects,
13 ACO extensions, et cetera, involving these three
14 reservoirs.

15 Happy holidays to everybody and your
16 families.

17 Thank you.

18 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Happy holidays to you
19 too.

20 MR. LINTERIS: Thanks.

21 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Bob Guarasci.

22 MR. GUARASCI: Good afternoon.

23 I wanted to, I guess, at the outset, I
24 wanted to at the outset just to confirm, it's my
25 understanding that Mr. Getz is going to make a

1 presentation today. Correct?

2 I'd like this Board to consider to allow
3 members of the public to ask questions after that
4 presentation because under the normal course of
5 how these meetings are conducted, this is our only
6 opportunity, but in the spirit of fairness and I
7 think in the spirit of the genuineness with which
8 this process has been rolled out, I think it's
9 only fair that you allow us to ask questions after
10 the presentation as members of the public. So I
11 would appreciate the opportunity to do so.

12 What I also want to say is that I think
13 it's very important before this public body makes
14 a decision on what it's going to send to the DEP
15 with respect to the Modified Consent Order, that
16 before you make that decision, that there also be
17 a public process which provides the public an
18 opportunity to ask questions and to have those
19 questions answered.

20 In other words, rather than just voting
21 without doing it in the context of a public
22 hearing or public process, I think what really
23 denied the public would have been so interested in
24 this, an opportunity to participate in a genuine
25 way from start to finish.

1 You know, along those lines, at the last
2 meeting this Commission passed a budget. I was a
3 little concerned because copies of that budget
4 were not made available to the public. And I
5 think that any time a public agency does something
6 as serious as passing a budget, that certainly,
7 copies of that budget should be available for
8 distribution to the public. And more importantly,
9 there ought to, again, be a public process to
10 allow the people to ask questions about how this
11 body is determining it should spend hundreds of
12 millions of dollars.

13 I think, I'm not sure, that every
14 ratepayer will face an increase of five percent
15 next year as a result of the budget passed. And I
16 don't think that it's right that the people who
17 this body serves ought to have an opportunity to
18 ask questions about that budget. It happens in
19 almost every other public body, and I think it
20 needs to happen here.

21 The issue of the reservoirs I think has
22 been a good thing because it has brought more
23 public participation to the affairs of this
24 agency. And I don't mean this in an insulting
25 way, but I think it's accurate to say that this

1 body has been very insolent before the reservoir
2 issue, that you largely operated behind closed
3 doors simply because that's the way it always was.

4 The reservoir issue shows that the people,
5 the ratepayers, have a genuine interest in the
6 workings of this agency. And I continue to call
7 for increased sunlight into how the affairs here
8 are conducted. I commend you for having made
9 progress in that regard, but I think more process
10 needs to be made and I cite the budget as one of
11 those.

12 And so, again, my main point today is to
13 say to you: We're here to listen to the
14 presentation and please allow us to participate
15 and ask questions. I think that's very important.

16 Thank you.

17 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: You're welcome.

18 Mr. David Soo.

19 MR. SOO: Good afternoon, members of the
20 Commission, staff, public, everybody that's here.

21 I want to talk about LT2 and the
22 reservoirs and how we're going to comply with LT2
23 and also be sympathetic and meet other needs of
24 the public.

25 Now, I'm not going to refute that the

1 compliance with LT2 is necessary. It's not what
2 I'm here to do.

3 I would like to speak first about Levine
4 Reservoir. Now, the current plan, as I understand
5 it, is to cap and tank that reservoir. The State
6 Historic Preservation Office has said because it's
7 in a national landmark historic district directly
8 adjacent to our national park, that would be an
9 adverse effect both for the draining and capping
10 of the reservoir and for the installation of the
11 tanks.

12 Now, there are alternatives that have been
13 discussed. One is to locate the tanks at a
14 different site or to have post-treatment of the
15 water as it leaves the reservoir and heads to the
16 pumping station on Grand Street.

17 I would implore you to only consider
18 seriously the alternatives. My reasoning is that
19 we have a landmark district, a contributing
20 feature in the landmark district, which is the
21 reservoir, but we also have our national park.

22 Now, for something that I feel is
23 important that I clarify and I tried to clarify it
24 at the last meeting, and I have a presentation
25 board which I brought last time. When I spoke to

1 your consultants at the NJCDC building, they said
2 they were principally focused on mitigation. How
3 do you make the impact of the tanks less, but
4 still build tanks. And they said that they were
5 principally concerned with people seeing the
6 tanks. So they situated the tanks on the far end
7 of the reservoir so as to be further from Grand
8 Street so you wouldn't see them when you drive by.
9 And they showed us aerial videos that had some
10 kind of remote helicopter so what you would see if
11 you're down in the parking lot by the Great Falls.

12 What I pointed out to them, which is on
13 this board, and I hope everybody can see the
14 board, this sticker is where the reservoir is.
15 Right here is the fence line. This whole area is
16 national landmark historic district. Right here
17 where the green scape is the national park. The
18 view of the tanks that we are most principally
19 concerned with is not from Grand Street, it's not
20 from the Great Falls because you can't see it from
21 the Great Falls, it's from the national park
22 itself. And the national park itself is zero lot
23 line, not a thousand feet away, more like 50 feet
24 away from where these tanks are going to be. And
25 this trail map from 1995 represents the trail that

1 the National Park Service has been working on to
2 reopen and the trail will be reopened in 2016,
3 hopefully, by late spring.

4 So we're going to have park visitors all
5 up through here and the trail runs right past the
6 fence line of the reservoir. It is impossible to
7 mitigate the view of the tanks if people are
8 standing right in front of them. It's impossible.
9 The reservoir will be gone, the tanks will be
10 there, and the national park will be harmed.

11 Now, look, every organization and
12 community of interest in this country has what is
13 important to them and what they understand as
14 being good and bad. This Commission is driven by
15 the need to provide quality drinking water to its
16 consumers and that's greatly appreciated. But
17 there is a historic preservation community. There
18 is a community of people that are concerned with
19 national parks. This national park is forever.
20 It has exactly the same standing as Yellowstone
21 National Park, Grand Canyon, Jamestown, Arlington
22 Cemetery, Mount Vernon, Liberty State Park, and
23 Gettysburg Battlefield. If somebody went and said
24 we're going to put concrete tanks and cap a lake
25 or reservoir, not in some desperate corner, right

1 there, right in the heart of the park, right next
2 to it, right next to Gettysburg Battlefield we're
3 going to put concrete tanks, people would gag. It
4 would be a joke on a joke.

5 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Mr. Soo, can you
6 please start to wrap up.

7 MR. SOO: So I think there has to be the
8 use of an alternative, because if we go forward
9 and do this, we're going to make our community a
10 laughing stock. It's going to be a shame that
11 we're not going to overcome in the context of our
12 national park because the congressmen and senators
13 and President Obama who signed this park into law
14 just a few years ago, they're still there. And if
15 they find out that this is the way we treat
16 ourselves and our community, this is an enormous
17 opportunity, communities would weep and beg for a
18 national park and Paterson so desperately needs.

19 I live in Paterson for 25 years. We need
20 this. We need breaks. We need help. We need
21 something to work out. And if you tank this
22 reservoir, it's going to harm the quality of that
23 opportunity and it's going to damage the city and
24 the people in it and it's going to damage this
25 region and it's going to harm this park and no

1 good will come of it.

2 So I know it's more money for an
3 alternative. But really, we don't have a choice.

4 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Thank you.

5 MR. SOO: We have to do the right thing by
6 our community and tanking and draining the
7 reservoir I think would be an egregious error.

8 Madam Chair, I'm finished.

9 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Thank you.

10 MR. SOO: Thank you very much.

11 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: You're welcome.

12 Motion to close.

13 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Move.

14 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Second.

15 MR. AMODIO: Move by Commissioner Bazian.

16 Second by Commissioner Kolodziej.

17 On the roll.

18

19 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
20 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
21 Sanchez is not present)

22

23 MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

24 The time is 12:37.

25 We have Mr. Getz here. If you would like

1 to, Mr. Getz.

2 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: You can do your
3 presentation.

4 MR. GETZ: Members of the Commission and
5 members of the public, I wanted to give you our
6 presentation today on the public outreach and
7 engagement process.

8 As you know, my name is Joe Getz,
9 principal with the firm JGSC Group. We were
10 retained in June to conduct this. Our work is now
11 complete. We have submitted a draft report to the
12 Commission and we're asking that you take about a
13 week or so to review it and then whatever comments
14 or revisions might be there, we will publish that
15 report and you can, I assume, make that public at
16 that time.

17 This presentation summarizes our report,
18 the contents of our report.

19 There were three primary goals in our
20 project and that was: Number one. Engage the
21 public, all of the public. There had been some
22 discussion in 2014 at the public meetings about
23 whether or not all of the public had been involved
24 in the process, so our first goal was get them all
25 involved.

1 The second was to have a meaningful
2 exchange so that they could understand the scope
3 of the project and voice their preferences and
4 their opinions.

5 And the third thing was to allow them an
6 opportunity to suggest possible alternatives to
7 the project, whether those were new technologies
8 or whether they were just alternate ideas.

9 The target audience that we put together
10 involved really a few different groups. The first
11 was reaching out to public officials and members
12 of the news media because those people answered to
13 constituents and they also help to publicize the
14 news, so we made sure we met with all those
15 people.

16 The next group we selected, you can see in
17 the darker blue, there's a very dark blue circle
18 on the map. That's a half mile radius, the white
19 dot in the middle represents where the Levine
20 Reservoir would be. But that's a half mile
21 radius. We wanted to talk to everyone within the
22 half mile radius because not only will they have
23 all of the impacts of all the other ratepayers,
24 but they're also going to deal with the
25 construction, traffic, and that sort of thing.

1 Then the medium blue shaded is your
2 primary service area. These are the people who
3 pay for the water; your residential and your
4 commercial customers and we wanted to make sure
5 that they had an opportunity to weigh in on it.

6 And then the lighted blue are people who
7 buy water from you on a wholesale basis and we
8 made sure that we spoke with the superintendents
9 and the operators of those facilities so that they
10 can express or pass on whatever information they
11 want to their consumers.

12 The tools that we used throughout the
13 process were a series of direct mail vehicles. We
14 used social media. We used public workshops. We
15 used door to door visits. Neighborhood fliers.
16 We had a website that we put together. And there
17 was a survey that was produced in both a printed
18 and an online version.

19 Bob Guarasci's group, NJCDC, assisted us
20 with helping distribute information to the
21 community. They not only handed out fliers, they
22 also helped to promote and in fact they hosted the
23 public workshops that we had. So we think that
24 the outreach effort was all encompassing.

25 During the survey when the survey results

1 came in, you'll notice the 82 percent we asked the
2 question of people: How familiar are you with
3 this issue, specifically, because we wanted to be
4 sure that we were reaching to people who had not
5 been involved in the process before and making
6 sure that they complied without outreach.

7 82 percent of the people said prior to the
8 outreach they had little or no knowledge about the
9 project. So we think it was all encompassing and
10 we think that was successful.

11 In terms of actual participation, there's
12 an orange line here which represents the maximum
13 number of people to have participated in the 2014
14 public meetings. The estimate was between 50 and
15 70 people at each of those meetings. There were a
16 total of six meetings. So this represents about
17 420 people who participated in those meetings.

18 The outreach effort and the survey that we
19 conducted had nearly 5,000 responses. So there
20 shouldn't be any question at all about was it not
21 only all inclusive in terms of who it went to, but
22 whether or not people participated.

23 We had created and still remains, I
24 believe, on the website some additional web pages
25 that offered information about the project. It

1 helped to explain issues. It gave access to the
2 feasibility study. It gave access to the
3 alternative site study, things of that nature.
4 And 1,146 unique visitors went to that website. I
5 can't tell you what they did or didn't read, but I
6 know that 1,146 people as of December 1st had gone
7 to that website.

8 And, finally, when we did the surveys, the
9 surveys were only about 12 questions long, but one
10 of the most important things was at the back end
11 of the survey there was an opportunity for people
12 to offer a comment, a suggestion, or anything that
13 they wanted to say. So it was completely open in
14 nature and the reason for that was so that no one
15 could say: Oh, you didn't give an opportunity to
16 be heard. Everyone had an opportunity to be
17 heard. And 1,247 people took that opportunity.
18 And we have included all of those verbatim remarks
19 into the report for you to read.

20 The ones that came up at the workshop -- I
21 should note that we had two workshops. There were
22 about 47 unique adult individuals, I want to put
23 it that way because there was students who stayed
24 and participated, but in terms of adults, there
25 were about 47 unique adult individuals who

1 participated in the workshop. And where we could,
2 we captured their remarks, although, those are not
3 verbatim, they are reflected in the report.

4 Everybody else's remarks are verbatim.

5 One of the important things that we began
6 to realize when we began this process was that
7 people didn't really understand the project
8 overall. For an example, we learned early on that
9 people didn't realize that finished drinking water
10 was being stored in open reservoirs. And we
11 thought that was important to make them understand
12 that or to allow them to understand that before
13 they then voiced opinions about and preferences on
14 other topics.

15 So we asked that question in a survey and
16 we put an illustration in there that showed the
17 process of water coming from the reservoir to the
18 treatment plant -- I'm sorry -- from the river to
19 the treatment plant to the reservoir to their
20 faucet. 69 percent of the people said they didn't
21 realize that water was being stored in open
22 reservoirs. Then we said: Well, now that you
23 know that, how do you feel about it. Do you think
24 it's a good idea or a bad idea. 82 percent of the
25 people who responded to the survey, again, keep in

1 mind it's almost 5,000 people, 82 percent said
2 they don't think the water should be stored in
3 open reservoirs.

4 We then explained to them that the LT2
5 Rule which has been a matter of some discussion
6 and conversation, LT2 Rule on our research, we
7 found that the Safe Water Drinking Act says if
8 you're going to revise the LT2 Rule, which is part
9 of what's going through in this review, then you
10 either have to maintain or increase the level of
11 protection that it offers. The repeal of the LT2
12 Rule really isn't an option under the Safe Water
13 Drinking Act. So we explained that.

14 Then we asked people: Knowing this, what
15 do you think we should do? Should we standstill
16 even if we might get fined or have other penalties
17 or should we proceed with the project.

18 Again, 82 percent of the respondents said
19 we think you should proceed with the project as
20 opposed to any delay.

21 There are really, in the feasibility
22 study, there are seven possible alternatives for
23 possible solutions. Four of those really involve
24 variations of tanks, one form or another. So we
25 drove it down to three different variations and we

1 said your options that exist are: Retreating the
2 water after it leaves the reservoir, putting a
3 cover and liner on the reservoir, or doing some
4 sort of solution with tanks. For each, we listed
5 the advantages, the disadvantages, and the
6 pricing. And we used the information from the
7 feasibility study when writing those advantages,
8 disadvantages, and costs. Given that, which of
9 these three potential solutions do you think we
10 should pursue.

11 You can see that by a margin of three to
12 one, people were telling us they think we should
13 go forward with storage tanks compared to
14 retreatment. And cover and liners got merely
15 three percent of the responses.

16 We then asked the followup question which
17 was: If it's tanks, if the answer is to build
18 tanks, do you think we should build them at the
19 Levine Reservoir or do you think we should build
20 them somewhere else. And we offered the
21 alternate. There was an alternative site analysis
22 done. We offered them the points about the
23 alternate site, the one that was found to be
24 viable and we offered the points about Levine
25 Reservoir. And 97 percent of the respondents said

1 that they think it's important that we build it at
2 the Levine Reservoir as opposed to an alternate
3 site.

4 Again, it's important to understand that
5 because the audience we're talking to at this
6 point is so much larger than the audience that
7 participated in the public meetings in 2014, that
8 these really are much more representative of what
9 the general public would hold as an opinion.

10 Then there was a question of visible
11 impact. And Mr. Soo spoke to that this morning.
12 What we offered was four possible options on a
13 question that said: If the answer is to build
14 tanks, if that's the final decision, should we
15 just build a tank as proposed, which wouldn't have
16 an additional cost, or should we use planting or
17 painted murals or some combination of those. And
18 then we told them what the maximum possible cost
19 was. There were some people who said \$200,000 to
20 plant trees is ridiculous. And it may be. What
21 we were striving to do was offer an apples to
22 apples comparison and to give a maximum number.
23 For an example, the cost of painting a mural could
24 be as low as \$33,000 but it could also be as high
25 as 250. We didn't want to misrepresent what the

1 possible costs were so we made sure that we put
2 all of those there.

3 You can see the results. 73 percent of
4 the people said basically what we'd like to see
5 are the tanks built. If it's tanks, just build
6 them and do whatever it is you do with them, but
7 don't worry about trees; don't worry about
8 plantings.

9 And this really rides us to a bigger issue
10 that emerged from all this work and that is the
11 number one concern of everyone seems to be that
12 they want quality drinking water. And that's
13 completely understandable. But there's also a big
14 level of concern about cost. And we heard that
15 repetitively throughout the process and throughout
16 the survey.

17 We also questioned the historical impact.
18 Again, as Mr. Soo said, our job was to say if you
19 build something there and it has an impact, what
20 can you do to help mitigate some of that impact.
21 So we offered six suggestions that were put
22 together by the historical consultants and those
23 ranged from documenting the existence of the
24 current reservoir all the way down to creating
25 educational videos about the park.

1 What's interesting about this is that none
2 of the six options received more than a majority
3 of the total votes. You could vote anywhere from
4 zero to 100 percent on any one of these. That
5 said, reserving, preserving a portion of the lake,
6 46 percent of the people said that they thought
7 that would be a good idea. Documenting the
8 existing reservoir, 43 percent of them said that
9 would be a good idea.

10 And I believe that this information should
11 be helpful to SHIPO when you get there for the
12 Section 106 part of this process, explaining to
13 them what the options are and what people in
14 general think about it.

15 And then the last slide is the
16 alternatives and things that we heard. As I
17 mentioned before, 1,247 people took the time to
18 write comments. Some of them were very, very
19 impassioned. Some of them were a little bit off
20 the mark. I remember someone who wrote to us
21 about how bad their pension is. But overall,
22 there was a theme where people sort of reinforced
23 the selections and preferences they have made
24 throughout the survey. So if they were someone
25 who was saying keep the cost down, it was likely

1 we got a comment at the back end that said: Keep
2 the cost down.

3 We took all 1,247 comments, as we said,
4 they're included in the report for you, verbatim,
5 and we sent them up to PVWC and asked them to sort
6 through them for technology and alternatives and
7 solutions and things like that because we really
8 don't understand enough about the technology
9 itself.

10 They basically came back and said there
11 appeared to be eight suggested alternatives here
12 that range from -- some of them repeat issues that
13 we've already measured, installing a cover and
14 liner or treating the water after it leaves the
15 reservoir. Other suggestions rise to the levels
16 of technology, like why can't you use shade balls
17 to cover the reservoir like they do in California,
18 and so on and so forth.

19 So PVWC Engineering Department looked at
20 these and has submitted the response or addressed
21 each one of these and that information also will
22 be included in the -- or also is included in the
23 draft report right now that we're going to ask you
24 to approve.

25 Finally, that brings me to the next step.

1 And I've been doing this for about 30 years now
2 and I have never done a survey that has had this
3 many people respond to it. There's an awful lot
4 of interest. There were probably about a dozen
5 people who said, you know, you're trying to scam
6 us, you don't know what you're doing, your
7 questions are leading. And for any one of those,
8 there were dozens more who said: Thank you for
9 taking time to ask us our opinion.

10 I remember, and I know we discussed it
11 yesterday during a meeting, one of the people
12 said: I'm a music teacher, ask me about music.
13 Ask me about a B flat, I understand. I don't
14 understand anything about this, but I really do
15 appreciate the fact that you allowed me to weigh
16 in on it.

17 So I think reaching out to all of those
18 stakeholders; whether they are public officials,
19 whether they are people who buy the wholesale
20 water from you, whether they are your ratepayers,
21 is an important next step because, frankly, a lot
22 of people put a lot of time into this and I think
23 they want to know that you take it seriously, as
24 I'm sure you will.

25 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Thank you.

1 Mr. Guarasci, Commissioners, any
2 questions?

3 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: First of all, maybe
4 you said this already and I didn't hear it. I was
5 curious, how many surveys did you send out and
6 response rate?

7 MR. GETZ: Well, the response rate was
8 around 3.6 which I think is incredibly high for a
9 survey. There were 125,600 something.

10 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Okay. And under
11 normal circumstances, what is your experience in
12 terms of response rate?

13 MR. GETZ: We had predicted we would get
14 between 800 and 1,100 responses here.

15 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: So you received
16 anywhere between four and five times more than you
17 expected.

18 MR. GETZ: Yes, sir.

19 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: You had mentioned
20 some additional cost figures, for example, the
21 landscaping or the murals.

22 MR. GETZ: Can you go back?

23 That one.

24 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Yes. I'm curious
25 where those numbers came from?

1 MR. GETZ: We had researched what other
2 communities had paid for the murals themselves and
3 then we were provided with the numbers for the
4 planting from, I'm assuming the engineers or your
5 engineering consultants. I don't know exactly
6 who, but we were provided those numbers.

7 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Well, okay. One
8 concern I have on this particular thing is,
9 obviously, everybody is going to be concerned
10 about money. So if somebody is going to say:
11 Gee, we'll do a mural for \$30,000, we may have a
12 higher yes rate than 250 is my concern. I
13 understand you were being conservative on the cost
14 and I get that. But this one question needs, the
15 figures you have here, the cost figures, I would
16 have been interested to hear: Okay. If you think
17 it's going to be \$30,000, let's say your lower
18 number, if it's 30,000 or if it's 250,000, don't
19 you think that would have been a little bit more
20 informative.

21 MR. GETZ: With all due respect, I know I
22 was going to be criticized for either being too
23 liberal or too conservative. I don't mean by you.
24 I don't mean by you. I knew there was going to be
25 criticism if we were either too liberal or too

1 conservative on it.

2 When we looked at numbers, for an example
3 of the murals, because I didn't pull the numbers
4 together for the plantings, but when we looked for
5 numbers for the murals, we did see one that had
6 cost 33,000 and we saw one that had 250,000 and we
7 saw several others that cost in the \$160,000,
8 \$180,000, \$200,000 range. So, again, I just
9 didn't want to be in a position where we said to
10 someone: You can do this for 33,000 and then they
11 said: Oh, yeah, I support it and it got to the
12 Commission and it cost now \$200,000.

13 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: I understand.

14 MR. GETZ: And I appreciate your position
15 on it, sir.

16 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Commissioner DeVita.

17 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Question: Under
18 historical impact, what is "documenting existing
19 reservoir."

20 MR. GETZ: I don't have the exact phrase
21 here for it. But it's create a document that
22 talks about the history of the reservoir, how it
23 was created, the changes it's been through and
24 things of that nature.

25 As you probably know, the reservoir itself

1 wasn't created until 1885 which is about 90 years
2 after the whole raceway and the Society
3 Establishment of Useful Manufacturers.

4 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: So, basically,
5 that's paperwork.

6 MR. GETZ: It might be in the form of a
7 file you could put on your website.

8 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: It's not to
9 preserve? That's something physical.

10 MR. GETZ: Right, yes.

11 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Commissioner Levine.

12 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: On the surveys, did
13 most people fill out all the questions or were a
14 lot of them left off?

15 MR. GETZ: Well, there's typically a drop
16 off. I think we started out at maybe, as I said,
17 about 4,800 on the very first and to the open
18 comments, which was the very last question, there
19 were 1,247 of those. In between it was probably
20 well over 3,000, over 3,500. So there's some
21 typical drop off that occurs when you do a survey,
22 but it's not like we saw people dramatically
23 disappear.

24 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: Most of the
25 questions had at least 3,000 with 82 percent --

1 MR. GETZ: Three thousand; 3,500; yes.

2 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: The last question:
3 Is there a way, what you're giving us the results
4 of the survey, for the public to know the results
5 of the survey? Like on the website? A mailing?

6 MR. GETZ: We printed out from the website
7 where the survey was conducted. We printed out
8 all of the results and that is included as one of
9 the addendums in the public report, the report
10 that we submitted to you.

11 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: How is the public
12 going to get that?

13 MR. GETZ: I'm sorry?

14 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: When it gets
15 submitted to us, how is the public going to get
16 that report?

17 MR. GETZ: I don't want to get into your
18 process.

19 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: You don't do that?
20 That's what I'm saying. You don't give the public
21 the results of your survey?

22 MR. GETZ: That's not part of the scope of
23 our contract. Our job is to report back to you.

24 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: I just want to
25 bring you up to date. All three Commissioners

1 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Okay. So that's
2 kind of where we will be going when we go to
3 closed session.

4 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Forgive me,
5 Commissioner, I just want to be clear. Will we be
6 discussing contractual options in closed session
7 as to whether --

8 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Yes. Exactly.
9 Whether we want to enter into an additional
10 contract addendum to do greater reporting on what
11 you're seeing today.

12 Like I said, some of the options will have
13 a zero cost factor so those I know you're going to
14 approve right away. But there's others that will
15 have a price tag and whether we want to continue
16 that or not, that's an individual response. But
17 that will be our choice today.

18 But we are not making a decision today.
19 You're all getting the same presentation we got
20 yesterday. And even watching it the second time,
21 I picked up things I missed the first time. So
22 you're going to need time to really look at it.

23 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: I'm just curious,
24 when can I actually see the report? When will I
25 have a report in hand that I can read and review?

1 MR. GETZ: The report is on the PVWC --
2 it's in your file now. It's in the possession of
3 PVWC at this point as a PDF file. And I spoke
4 with Lou before the meeting, it's contractually
5 not before you, but contractually, I have to
6 communicate back and forth with the Engineering
7 Department and I understand they've been a little
8 busy the last two days down at the plant. But we
9 transmitted the report there and I think if Lou
10 can access that or Joe, whoever can access it,
11 it's available at this point.

12 What we are asking, what we are suggesting
13 is that you all take an appropriate amount of time
14 to review that and let us answer any questions you
15 might have and then we will produce a final
16 report. It doesn't say "Draft" on it. But we'll
17 do that within like a day or two after you give us
18 the go ahead.

19 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Commissioner Levine.

20 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: On the survey, are
21 they anonymous? Do you have addresses to get back
22 in touch with them?

23 MR. GETZ: Well, there's a two-part
24 answer, but the main answer to your question is
25 the survey was conducted anonymously. There were

1 a number of people, several hundred, maybe more
2 than a thousand who went out of the way to make
3 sure --

4 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: Generally, not half
5 of them. We need to get in touch with all of
6 them.

7 MR. GETZ: No, you couldn't go back and
8 say: Thanks for taking the survey, here are the
9 results.

10 COMMISSIONER LEVINE: That's fine. Thank
11 you.

12 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Commissioners, anymore
13 questions?

14 Anyone from the public?

15 MR. GUARASCI: Yes, thank you for the
16 opportunity.

17 I appreciate the work product and a lot of
18 time and money went into it. I do want to just
19 offer what may be a little bit of a contrary
20 review. I know that may surprise you, but I do it
21 respectfully.

22 I think what I would say is that the very
23 foundation on which this survey is based is
24 inaccurate. And that is to say the graphic that
25 was promoted to educate people about how water

1 gets to one's home, I believe, was inaccurate
2 because it says that the water flows from the
3 river to the treatment plant to the reservoir and
4 then to one's home. What you have, I think, a
5 reasonable person to believe that each time he or
6 she opens his or her faucet that water is
7 untreated sitting in the reservoir is what flows
8 into their homes and I believe that that is
9 inaccurate. I think there are times when there's
10 an emergency situation, water may flow in that
11 fashion. There are times when a little bit of
12 that water is released and flows through that
13 system. But to suggest that every drop of water
14 that comes into one's home is untreated after it
15 leaves the reservoir is simply inaccurate.

16 And, again, the very, again, I would say
17 the very foundation on which this is based is
18 inaccurate; and that is to say that you never
19 provided the public with what I believe is the
20 most compelling option of all, and that is to
21 decommission the reservoir. The public was never
22 given the option of saying: We believe the best
23 thing to do here is decommission the reservoir and
24 perhaps, use as we later found out as an
25 alternative, water flowing from the Wanaque

1 reservoir which is not ideal, because you cannot
2 store as local as might be advisable, but it is a
3 very viable option.

4 And so I have serious problems with the
5 conclusions here because, again, the option which
6 I think was the most compelling to people to
7 decommission the reservoir was never even
8 provided.

9 So I think it's a pretty product and as I
10 say, I do appreciate all the time and effort and
11 money that went into it, but I do believe that it
12 is a fraud product.

13 Thank you.

14 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Anyone else?

15 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Yes, Commissioner.

16 For clarification for myself, I'm under
17 the impression that the water does leave the
18 reservoir and go to your home. There isn't any
19 other treatment between your home and the
20 reservoir. You're saying that it is.

21 MR. GUARASCI: No, what I'm saying, and,
22 Joe, I could be wrong.

23 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Clear me up here.

24 MR. GUARASCI: What I was told as a
25 layperson, what I understand, initially, what I

1 came to understand is the reservoir is an
2 emergency backup reservoir. That water only flows
3 into people's home full force if something happens
4 at the treatment plant or other issues prevent the
5 treated water from coming into people's homes.

6 Then I understood a little bit differently
7 that there's constantly added flow there that such
8 that water is leaving the reservoir everyday, but
9 it would only represent a very, very small
10 percentage of water that enters into one's home
11 and one's faucet. And all I'm saying is if you
12 look at the way this was presented, the average
13 person would say: Oh, my goodness, every drop of
14 water from my house is coming from that reservoir
15 and I just don't think that that's accurate.

16 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Well, I'm on the
17 Board, I don't consider myself average but that's
18 what I understood it to be.

19 Joe, can you clear it up for me?

20 MR. BELLA: Well, you got to look at it
21 this way. Sometimes you're getting water that
22 comes directly from the reservoir and sometimes
23 you're not. It depends on what's going on in the
24 system.

25 When you're getting water from the

1 reservoir, you're a hundred percent getting water
2 from the reservoir. You, your kid, is getting
3 water, a hundred percent of the water from that
4 reservoir that's been contaminated, that's been
5 altered from the original condition which we
6 worked so hard and spent so much money to get it
7 into. There's no ifs, ands, and buts about this.

8 MR. GUARASCI: That's on rare occasions.

9 MR. BELLA: It's not a rare occasion.
10 It's on a daily basis, an hourly basis, even a
11 minute-to-minute basis.

12 MR. GUARASCI: A hundred percent?

13 MR. BELLA: It can be a hundred percent in
14 your house depending on where you are and what's
15 going on in the system.

16 Right now, today, a hundred percent of the
17 water coming into our system is from our
18 reservoirs.

19 MR. GUARASCI: From Levine?

20 MR. BELLA: From Levine.

21 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Madam President,
22 this is his question.

23 MR. BELLA: You tend to oversimplify
24 things which is really kind of, I wouldn't say
25 disingenuous, it's just misleading to people. It

1 is there and that probability, that even the small
2 probability that you will get that water is a
3 problem. You will get it. People will get water
4 directly from that reservoir. There are people
5 that get water directly. So you must treat all of
6 the water all the time to make it work in
7 accordance with modern treatment standards and
8 what people have come to expect. Not some of the
9 time, not occasionally; all of the time.

10 MR. GUARASCI: Well, let me just say this:
11 We can agree to disagree here.

12 MR. BELLA: No, we really shouldn't.

13 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: But are your questions
14 for --

15 MR. GUARASCI: Yes, my question is for Mr.

16 --

17 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Pertaining to the
18 presentation because that's what you asked for to
19 be able to speak regarding the presentation.

20 MR. GUARASCI: I'll rephrase it.

21 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Okay.

22 MR. GUARASCI: Joe, would it be reasonable
23 for me to believe that when I open up my faucet at
24 217 Elberon Avenue in Paterson that the majority
25 of time that water is coming, not from the

1 reservoir, but from the treatment plant?

2 MR. BELLA: It is, much of the time, you
3 can be getting water from there. It depends.
4 Again, you can't say the majority of the time or
5 not, because it really varies. Some of the times
6 it's a hundred percent of the time and some of the
7 times it's zero percent of the times. So you are
8 getting the water from there. And during that one
9 hundred percent of the time, you're getting a
10 hundred percent of the time of that water.

11 MR. GUARASCI: What is the meaning of the
12 word --

13 MR. BELLA: No, I don't think there's --
14 there's nothing to be debated about this. At that
15 point the water is non-compliant with things and
16 that's what counts. That's what's important. And
17 if you're a little kid that gets sick and gets
18 dehydrated and has to go to the hospital and you
19 only got one hour a day, you're sick. He's sick a
20 hundred percent of the time.

21 That's enough. I had enough. We
22 discussed this for a hundred times.

23 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Thank you, Joe.

24 MR. GETZ: Could I address the two
25 questions?

1 The two questions that were raised was
2 one, that the illustration was misrepresenting.
3 And I don't believe it misrepresents. As Bob
4 pointed out and as Joe has pointed out, the system
5 doesn't operate in exactly the same way every
6 single day. But the essence of the issue that we
7 wanted to share with consumers was that there's a
8 problem with storing finished drinking water in an
9 open reservoir. And if that is factual and if it
10 wasn't factual, none of us would be sitting here
11 today having this conversation because you would
12 not be out of compliance with the LT2 Rule. So I
13 do believe that was factual.

14 The second comment was, help me, Bob.

15 MR. GUARASCI: The presentation did not
16 have decommissioning as an alternative.

17 MR. GETZ: Yes. And the reason it did not
18 have that is because we didn't want to make up
19 things as we went along. There were two pieces to
20 this, if you will, in the questions. The first
21 piece was what was it that was contained in the
22 feasibility study because that is what lead to the
23 public meetings in 2014 which lead to our being
24 hired to do additional outreach. And those
25 options, as I said during the presentation that

1 were included in the feasibility study, were
2 included in the survey.

3 But secondarily, there was an open ended
4 comment area at the back end which allowed people
5 to offer any suggestion or comment. And as I
6 remarked, more than 1,200 people took advantage of
7 that.

8 So I just want to be clear that there was
9 an opportunity for people to do it.

10 MR. GUARASCI: The only thing I would
11 state, and I appreciate the opportunity for this
12 dialogue. As a layperson, I say before this
13 Commission with one hundred percent certainty that
14 a hundred percent of one's water does not come
15 from the reservoir as untreated. It's only on
16 rare occasion that the water that comes out of the
17 faucet is coming from the reservoir.

18 And secondly, I do believe from the very
19 beginning the option of decommissioning the
20 reservoir should have been offered as a viable
21 option because it is a viable option.

22 Joe, we may disagree on this, but the fact
23 of the matter is that that reservoir is an
24 emergency standby reservoir that is only providing
25 water some of the time to some of the people. And

1 if anything is misleading, it was the graphic that
2 suggested that every time one opens his or her
3 faucet that all that water is coming from the
4 reservoir at Levine because you know that's not
5 true and I know that's not true.

6 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Are there anymore
7 questions?

8 MR. LINTERIS: Can I just say something?
9 It's my understanding --

10 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Well, this is supposed
11 to be a question and answer period, not statement
12 and statement period. So if you have anymore
13 questions, let's ask the questions.

14 Yes, Commissioner.

15 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Actually, I'd like
16 to make a suggestion.

17 It's my understanding that we're all going
18 to get an opportunity to review this report.

19 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Correct.

20 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: My expectation is
21 that some form -- the report itself, this
22 information is going to be made available to the
23 public. There are going to be additional
24 opportunities for public comment and public
25 question.

1 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Correct.

2 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: And I'm wondering
3 whether it doesn't just make sense at this point
4 to give us an opportunity to review the
5 information so I guess we can ask better
6 questions, get more information perhaps at our
7 next meeting.

8 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: I was giving the
9 public what they asked for in the beginning of the
10 meeting if they could have the opportunity to ask
11 some questions from the presentation. So we've
12 done that.

13 Mr. Soo had a question but he's been
14 videotaping. He kept putting his hand up so and
15 then Mr. Linteris you can go after. But he's been
16 waving his hand.

17 Questions.

18 MR. SOO: Questions. My concern and the
19 concern of many people that I deal with in the
20 preservation, the historic preservation community
21 is that the State Historic Preservation Office has
22 already stated that there will be an adverse
23 effect for the removal of the reservoir and the
24 construction of the tanks and that the reservoir
25 is representative of the time of significance for

1 the National Landmark Historic District and that
2 the view of the tanks is directly adjacent to the
3 property from within the national park. That's
4 the most disconcerting view.

5 When I went to your presentation --

6 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Mr. Soo, could you
7 just get to your question, please.

8 MR. SOO: I'm trying to get you there.

9 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: No, no, I need you to
10 be there now.

11 MR. SOO: It's a predicate.

12 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: But --

13 MR. SOO: I'd already be done.

14 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: I need you to be there
15 now.

16 MR. SOO: Okay. Did your survey tell the
17 public that there was going to be an adverse
18 effect for the removal of the reservoir and the
19 construction of the tanks from the State Historic
20 Preservation Office?

21 MR. GETZ: In those exact words, no. And
22 since I don't have a survey in front of me, I
23 believe the survey said that doing anything at the
24 Levine Reservoir would create an adverse condition
25 and that --

1 MR. SOO: What kind of adverse condition,
2 though?

3 MR. GETZ: Well, I don't think we went
4 into explaining the adverse condition. What we
5 went into was saying there were things we may be
6 able to do to mitigate and if you have a
7 preference and, Joe, if we go to the next to last
8 slide.

9 MR. SOO: But that's mitigation, not
10 alternative.

11 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Madam President, I
12 come back to my earlier comment. The exact
13 questions I assume the nature of the survey is
14 going to be in the report. This is something that
15 if I have a document and I read the document I can
16 understand the questions and process the
17 information better. All right. I reiterate my
18 suggestion, these are all good questions. I'm not
19 in any way suggesting that the public should in
20 any way be cut off. I don't think giving us an
21 opportunity to review the report and getting the
22 report out there so people can review it in any
23 way compromises the public good. If anything, I
24 think it enhances the public good because it means
25 better information is out there. So I reiterate

1 my suggestion, I think we should just move on and
2 we can pick this up next month after I've had an
3 opportunity to read the report.

4 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: So noted.

5 MR. SOO: May I ask one last question?

6 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Point of order,
7 Madam Chair. All right. I have made a
8 suggestion. If necessary, I'll make it a motion.
9 Okay. The public does not participate in that
10 portion of the discussion.

11 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Okay.

12 MR. SOO: It's a question.

13 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: So do you want me to
14 make a decision?

15 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Please.

16 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Are you making a
17 motion?

18 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Madam Chair, I make
19 a motion to close the public portion.

20 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Second.

21 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Once again, Mr.
22 Guarasci, a single member of this Board has
23 asked -- the public has had an opportunity to
24 speak. All I'm suggesting right now, all I'm
25 suggesting is that --

1 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: There's a motion on
2 the floor and it's been seconded.

3 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: I withdraw my
4 second. Let the lady speak.

5 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Actually, Mr. Linteris
6 should be able to speak because he's been waiting
7 and then --

8 MR. SOO: I wasn't finished.

9 MR. LINTERIS: I'm okay.

10 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Are you sure?

11 MR. SOO: Madam Chair, may I ask my last
12 question?

13 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: You're rescinding your
14 motion. He's not rescinding his.

15 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: I rescind the
16 motion.

17 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: The motions have been
18 rescinded. We will only entertain the -- I'm
19 sorry, but I don't know your name.

20 MS. SHATBERG: (Phonetic) Oh, my name is
21 Ann, Ann Shatberg.

22 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Ann, we will only
23 entertain one question from Ann.

24 MS. SHATBERG: I get one question?

25 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Yes, ma'am.

1 MS. SHATBERG: I don't know what to ask.

2 I would like to know why is this presented
3 as a survey when clearly it does not present all
4 the options including the decommissioning? And I
5 have problems with the term "survey" because
6 clearly to me this appears to be a push poll. And
7 I don't know why this wasn't presented as a poll
8 because you have very tight restrictions on what
9 you're covering that are leading.

10 And why things like why not say between
11 30,000 to \$300,000 for trees, you know, depending
12 on what wonderful trees you get or why not keep
13 that range in there. Why have these
14 oversimplified. I think the people are saying the
15 public is oversimplifying this. The
16 oversimplification comes from the illustration of
17 the duck pooping in the cup of water and the
18 faucet coming from the reservoir right into my
19 house.

20 Our basic knowledge of chlorination, is
21 this to educate also the Commissioners on the
22 science involved in this matter and not just the
23 public's views of what's going on. And
24 communication is a very admirable thing. I like
25 communicating with the public. But how is this

1 intended to go because anyone with a basic
2 knowledge of chlorination, the water sitting out
3 in the ponds is dechlorinating itself. And I've
4 never seen one company in America would ever say
5 that they're doing such a terrible job as to be
6 feeding us water with animal feces in it straight
7 to our faucets.

8 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Excuse me. So your
9 question is why a survey and not a poll?

10 MS. SHATBERG: Why a survey and not a poll
11 and why that restrictions on that information?

12 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Okay. That's a
13 question.

14 MS. SHATBERG: It's a fine piece of work,
15 but --

16 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: But that's the
17 question.

18 MS. SHATBERG: It's got some problems.

19 MR. GETZ: I don't know how to answer
20 that. I've been doing this for 30 years. I'm not
21 really sure how I understand in this scenario the
22 distinction between a poll and survey. If it
23 would make you feel better, I would be happy to
24 call it a poll when I talk with you. But I think
25 it follows protocol. It follows industry

1 standards. And, I'm sorry, I don't know what else
2 to say.

3 MS. SHATBERG: Is this --

4 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: No. Motion to close.

5 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Move it.

6 MR. AMODIO: Motion by Commissioner

7 Bazian.

8 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Second.

9 MR. AMODIO: By Commissioner Kolodziej.

10

11 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
12 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
13 Sanchez is absent)

14

15 MR. AMODIO: The time is 1:22 p.m.

16 If you'd like to move onto committee
17 reports.

18 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Yes.

19 MR. AMODIO: Just to let you know, the
20 personnel issue the two gentlemen asked for the
21 discussion to be in closed session. You can't
22 mention their names, only the items.

23 So we'll start with personnel.

24 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Madam President, the
25 personnel committee met. All three Commissioners

1 were there. We went through a couple of
2 promotions that we are bringing forth,
3 recommending these people be promoted.

4 The discussion for Sick Time Donation
5 Program.

6 And I believe we have one other item to
7 add to that, the extended contract --

8 MR. AMODIO: The consultant.

9 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: The consultant
10 public relations people.

11 MR. AMODIO: Thank you. Is that your --

12 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: The contract we have
13 with the gentleman that just gave us the
14 presentation.

15 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: He's touching on
16 special projects.

17 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Okay.

18 MR. AMODIO: Finance.

19 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: I just have a
20 question because this is the third meeting in a
21 row, and I'm really going to have a problem come
22 January 1st with any new hires. This is my third
23 meeting that I've been asking for a Table of
24 Organization and all the positions that are filled
25 because I need to know that we have existing

1 you. You should have said that three meetings
2 ago.

3 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: I'm sorry, I want to
4 make sure you got that report.

5 MR. AMODIO: IT.

6 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: No report.

7 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Can we do legal?

8 MR. AMODIO: Legal.

9 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: We had a meeting.
10 We discussed itemization of the legal bills we're
11 getting. George is going to take care of that
12 with the firms.

13 We also discussed two matters that are
14 listed for closed session which will be discussed
15 there because they're contractual.

16 That's it.

17 MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

18 Special projects.

19 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Yes. We were
20 privileged to see this report first and we did
21 discuss it at length so I encourage all of you to
22 really go over the facts and I know that you will
23 have some additional input.

24 There were two other items that we talked
25 about and that's the confined spaces. It's our

1 recommendation that we continue to negotiate with
2 the Paterson Fire Department. It was unanimous
3 amongst our committee members that our first
4 concern is the safety of our workers and that
5 should never have a price tag. We have to do what
6 we have to do. But also being fiscally
7 responsible, we wanted to know what would need to
8 be used or done to meet with OSHA standards
9 because that's our next chief concern and that has
10 a dollar amount with that.

11 And then, obviously, part of the
12 negotiations will determine how long the contract
13 we would enter into and, again, it depends on
14 which of the menu that we are picking will
15 determine whether it's a one year, two year, three
16 year contract which will come back to us for
17 approval. But I think we're closer now to meeting
18 the needs of what we are required to do to keep
19 our employees safe and to also watch the
20 pocketbook of the ratepayers who pay for that.

21 MR. AMODIO: No other reports.

22 Executive Director, Joe.

23 MR. BELLA: Just quickly. I just wanted
24 to show you this real quick. It won't take long.

25 As you know, we have been doing this

1 major, basically, it's like a replacement heart
2 valve in a human here. I showed it to you briefly
3 and we're actually doing it and we're in the
4 process of doing it right this moment.

5 This is the valve here. This is probably
6 about 12,000 pounds of ancient steel.

7 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: 12,000?

8 MR. BELLA: Yes, 12,000.

9 This is one of our mains coming out of the
10 plant after it's been pumped. And it actually
11 flows into, you know, our system in general. It's
12 one of them. We have three major mains leaving
13 the plant. And this one has been broken for about
14 six months. It took about six months of planning
15 of other work. We've done other work. We did
16 line stops on a 48-inch pipe coming into the plant
17 from Wanaque. And over the course of the last two
18 days, basically, we replaced this thing.

19 You can go to the next.

20 You can see water still coming out. Now,
21 this is what it looks like after we made the,
22 basically, all of last night trying to get the
23 water out of the mains because believe it or not,
24 some of the old drawings were incorrect, as we
25 found out. And so we had to play some tricks to

1 new pipe. Two new valves and replacing the one,
2 so if we have a failure on one, we have another
3 one to isolate it and not have to go through the
4 trouble that we have to go through now.

5 That's it. That's what I wanted to tell
6 you.

7 Other than that, everything is going very
8 well. Right now we have water coming in from
9 other systems. We're relying on reservoirs, that
10 kind of thing, to supply water. Probably at this
11 moment almost all the water in the system is
12 coming from reservoirs.

13 MR. AMODIO: Any questions?

14 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: I know that there
15 is a cost factor involved with using water from
16 other places, so can you have that for the next
17 meeting? While this is down, what it's costing us
18 extra to do this. Okay.

19 MR. AMODIO: We'll move onto Controller's
20 report.

21 MR. WEISS: Cash on hand is 17.6 million.

22 Cash reserve is high because of our
23 operating reserve and our renewal extension
24 reserve fully funded for the end of the year which
25 is also great news.

1 Our accounts receivable is 17.6 million.

2 30 days or less accounts receivable is

3 16.3 million. That's 93 percent.

4 Our accounts payable is 3.5 million.

5 You've got in front of you a copy of the
6 Resolution to adopt the budget. We approved the
7 budget, as you know, two months ago. To be on
8 time we wanted to get the budget adopted today so
9 this way it's down in Trenton before the 1st. I
10 was on the phone this morning, actually, through
11 an e-mail exchange with the Division of Local
12 Government Services. They were reviewing all our
13 budget figures. They had a couple of questions.
14 They wanted some clarifications. They're
15 comfortable with the budget as we submitted it and
16 they said we can go forward with the adoption.

17 MR. AMODIO: Any questions?

18 Hearing none, is there a motion?

19 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: So moved.

20 MR. AMODIO: Second.

21 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Second.

22 MR. AMODIO: On the roll.

23

24 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
25 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner

1 Sanchez is absent).

2

3 MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

4 That will be it for open session.

5 Do I have a motion for closed?

6 COMMISSIONER BAZIAN: Moved.

7 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Second.

8 MR. BELLA: I forgot the Engineering
9 Department, Kevin Byrne, really planned this whole
10 operation; very extensive planning, very detailed
11 planning. Did a great job putting it all
12 together, reacting to some of these unusual
13 circumstances.

14 Same thing with the pump station
15 personnel; they did a fantastic job keeping
16 everything.

17 MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

18 Motion by Commissioner Bazian.

19 Second by Commissioner Kolodziej.

20 WHEREAS, Section 8 of the Open Public
21 Meetings Act permits the exclusion of the public
22 from a meeting in certain circumstances; and

23 WHEREAS, the public body is of the opinion
24 that such circumstances presently exist;

25 NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, by the

1 Commissioners of Passaic Valley Water Commission:

2 1. The public shall be excluded from
3 discussion of the hereinafter specified subject
4 matters; the general nature of the subject matters
5 being: Financial, Insurance, Personnel,
6 Contracts, Negotiations, Security, Law: We have
7 Summary/Aging reports; 2 Market Street Paterson;
8 Beirut Restaurant. Personnel: We have
9 promotions: Tim O'Brien and Jeffrey Baig.
10 Discussion of Sick Time Donation. Under
11 Administration: We have Project 16-P-12
12 "Insurance Agent Services", Project 15-P-54
13 "Professional Security Services" and discussion of
14 extension of JGSC Group's contract, and any other
15 matters as may be discussed in camera.

16 2. It is anticipated at this time that
17 above-stated subject matters will be ratified
18 during public meeting following or as soon
19 thereafter as the reason for discussion no longer
20 exists.

21 3. This Resolution shall take effect
22 immediately.

23 On the roll.

24

25 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners

1 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
2 Sanchez is absent)

3 MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

4 The time is 1:35.

5 Gentlemen, public, will you please clear
6 the room.

7

8 ***

9

10 MR. AMODIO: You have a quorum.

11 The time is 1:57.

12 Move onto Consent Agenda. We have the
13 minutes of Passaic Valley in camera and regular
14 session meetings held November 24th, 2015.

15 Do I have a motion?

16 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: So moved.

17 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Second.

18 MR. AMODIO: Second by Commissioner
19 Graddy.

20 Thank you.

21 On the roll.

22

23 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
24 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
25 Sanchez and Commissioner Bazian are absent)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

Move on.

Does the Chair accept, receive, and file
Miscellaneous Purchase Orders placed by Linda
Beckering, Purchasing Agent, for the period of
November 16th, 2015, to December 6th, 2015?

PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Yes.

MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

Resolutions. If you like we could do one
roll call.

COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Yes.

MR. AMODIO: Okay. First is item 6(a).

Contract 15-B-21 "Furnish and install ICP
Laboratory Equipment and Appurtenances"
Recommendation to reject and rebid.

(b) Contract 15-B-40. "Liquid Ferric
Sulfate. Recommendation to reject and rebid.

(C) Resolution recommending the renewal of
State contract for PVWC's phone/IVR System with
Current Vendor NEC Corporation for a three-year
term in the amount of \$40,685.26.00.26 totaling
\$122,055.78.

(d) Resolution of Passaic Valley Water
Commission designating its Public Compliance

1 Officer: Linda Beckering.

2 Questions?

3 Motion.

4 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: So moved.

5 MR. AMODIO: Motion by Commissioner

6 Kolodziej.

7 Do I have a second?

8 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Second.

9 MR. AMODIO: By Commissioner DeVita.

10 On the roll.

11

12 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
13 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
14 Sanchez and Commissioner Bazian are absent)

15

16 MR. AMODIO: Motion approved.

17 New Business. Summary of disbursements
18 and payrolls through December 16, 2015, in the
19 amount \$3,867,033.90.

20 Do I have a motion?

21 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: So moved.

22 MR. AMODIO: Motion by Commissioner

23 Kolodziej.

24 Do I have a second?

25 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Second.

1 MR. AMODIO: Second by Commissioner
2 DeVita.

3 On the roll.

4
5 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
6 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
7 Sanchez and Commissioner Bazian are absent)

8
9 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Abstain on Rachles
10 Michele.

11 MR. AMODIO: Move onto recommendations
12 from closed session.

13 We'll start with Personnel. We have
14 promotions of Timothy O'Brien to Water Repairer
15 Supervisor with a proposed salary \$64,724.40 and a
16 range of \$26,999.00 to \$71,385.60.

17 Next: Jeffrey Baig to Assistant General
18 Supervisor Water (TA) with a salary of \$79,591.20
19 and a range of \$51,667.20 to \$104,208.00.

20 Motion.

21 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: So moved.

22 MR. AMODIO: By Commissioner Kolodziej.

23 Second.

24 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Second.

25 MR. AMODIO: By Commissioner DeVita.

1 On the roll.

2

3 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
4 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
5 Sanchez and Commissioner Bazian are absent)

6

7 MR. AMODIO: Thank you.

8 Next we have project 15-P-54 "Professional
9 Security Services" Recommendation to award a
10 three-year contract to U.S. Security in the amount
11 of \$1,154,300.40.

12 Do I have a motion?

13 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: So moved.

14 MR. AMODIO: Motion by Commissioner
15 Kolodziej.

16 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Second.

17 MR. AMODIO: By Commissioner Graddy.

18

19 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
20 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
21 Levine responds in the negative. Commissioner
22 Sanchez and Commissioner Bazian are absent)

23 MR. AMODIO: Motion approved.

24 Next we move onto Project 16-P-12
25 "Insurance Agent Services for Property, Casualty,

1 Automobile, and Excess Liability" Recommendation
2 to award to Alamo in the amount not-to-exceed
3 three percent of the Commission's assessment.

4 Do I have a motion?

5 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Is it an assessment?

6 MR. AMODIO: Three percent assessment on
7 the JIF which is roughly \$16,712.52.

8 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Roughly?

9 MR. AMODIO: Exactly. According to our
10 Risk Manager Brown & Brown.

11 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: I'm moving it.

12 MR. AMODIO: Moved by Commissioner
13 Kolodziej.

14 Second.

15 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Second.

16 MR. AMODIO: By Commissioner Graddy.

17 On the roll.

18
19 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
20 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
21 Levine abstains. Commissioner Sanchez and
22 Commissioner Bazian are absent)

23 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: I think it's a shame
24 what happened with the mixup but, yes.

25 MR. AMODIO: Motion approved.

1 Jim Duprey or George, one of you, I don't
2 have any information on JGSC Group. If you'd like
3 to recite something.

4 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: The contract
5 extension.

6 MR. HANLEY: The motion will be to
7 authorize us to proceed on the basis of this form
8 of Resolution from the contract which is attached
9 to it to extend the professional services of the
10 public relations.

11 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: It's an
12 extension.

13 MR. HANLEY: Public education. And that
14 we would review it. Subject to our review to make
15 sure that it's consistent with the previous
16 contract. But in the meantime, we could proceed
17 to retain them until the next meeting.

18 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Right. And the
19 bottom line is a not-to-exceed amount because as
20 we're deciding what we need, we'll determine what
21 that amount will be.

22 MR. HANLEY: Right. Because it's only
23 really a one-month period. The amount is well
24 within limits. But the intention is to adopt
25 this.

1 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Right.

2 MR. AMODIO: Any questions?

3 Motion.

4 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: So moved.

5 MR. AMODIO: Motion by Commissioner

6 Kolodziej.

7 Do I have a second?

8 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: Second.

9 MR. AMODIO: By Commissioner Graddy.

10

11 (Roll call was taken, all Commissioners
12 present respond in the affirmative. Commissioner
13 Sanchez and Commissioner Bazian are absent.
14 Commissioner Levine is not in the room)

15

16 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Yes, I'm impressed
17 with their work.

18 MR. AMODIO: Motion approved.

19 We do have to make one decision today. We
20 have to schedule a meeting, a January meeting,
21 before we do anything else. If everyone is okay
22 with the third Wednesday of January at 12:00?

23 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: That's a
24 reorganization meeting.

25 MR. AMODIO: Yes, exactly. It's our reorg

1 meeting.

2 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Third Wednesday.
3 Sounds good to me. Half the people are missing
4 here, but... There's certainly ample time for
5 notification. So I think we should keep to the
6 third Wednesday of January as our reorganization
7 meeting. That will be the 20th. Correct?

8 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Yes.

9 MR. AMODIO: It will be the 20th, correct.
10 Under Good and Welfare, Madam President.

11 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Yes.

12 I would just like to commend Commissioner
13 DeVita for all of your hard work and dedication to
14 the Water Commission. I know I haven't served
15 with you long, but I do appreciate the wisdom and
16 knowledge that I have learned from you in the
17 short time that I've spent with you. I'm going to
18 miss you. We're going to give you 25 cookies for
19 your 25 years of service.

20 I hope you enjoy your holiday season and,
21 you know, God bless your future endeavors.

22 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Thank you.

23 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: And healthy travels
24 into the new year.

25 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: Thank you.

1 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Any other
2 Commissioners like to say something?

3 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: I'd like to say
4 this: My time is up now. I haven't been told I'm
5 not going to be here, but I can feel that I may or
6 may not be here. But I've learned a lot since
7 I've been here and one thing that I believe very
8 dearly that this Commission is dedicated to giving
9 its users clean water, clean and safe water at an
10 affordable price. It's one of the things that I'm
11 sure you're dedicated to doing. The decisions
12 that you make here is for the users.

13 How can I put this... You have some
14 troubling times ahead. Okay. So you're going to
15 have to make some hard decisions that's going to
16 come up, but I'm sure you're going to be focused
17 on doing the best thing for Passaic Valley Water
18 Commission.

19 It's been a pleasure for me being here.
20 I'd like to think that I was part of, when I first
21 came here, we had no public relation people and I
22 knew you had a lot of work ahead of you and I
23 think I started to suggest we got to get somebody
24 to help us. Today is a result of that type of
25 thing and I'm proud of that.

1 One of the things that I did concentrate
2 on when I got here is the workforce that you have.
3 Some people complained. One gentleman came to me
4 and complained he had an application for three
5 years and he come down once or twice a month,
6 never was anything available. Wasn't looking for
7 a position to be created and there are some
8 positions that a laborer can fill. He already had
9 his CDL license. I looked into it. When he told
10 me three years, I looked into it. It was true. I
11 finally got involved. Two months later I think we
12 hired him. He's fantastic in terms of the job
13 that he's doing. I understand we bought a new
14 truck and turned it over to him. Some of the
15 other things I'd done in that area.

16 What I would like to see happen is a
17 little better playing ground in terms of the
18 employees that you got coming to this Commission.
19 I went over to the Customer Service Department. I
20 looked into that department. There's no
21 African-Americans hardly in there. That's two
22 now. I understand one might be leaving soon. We
23 do need to do a little better job for the
24 African-Americans here. It's a good job. Just
25 like I said, I brought a few people on. They're

1 good people. And I do appreciate this Commission
2 for letting me pass them through.

3 With that, those two things, I'm pleased
4 to having been here. It's been an experience.
5 I'm moving on. I'm pretty sure I'm not going to
6 be reappointed. It's okay.

7 All of you have been great people,
8 absolutely marvelous people. I don't talk much,
9 but listen a lot and learn a lot when I listen.

10 All right.

11 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Mr. Bella.

12 MR. BELLA: Just real quick. I'd like to
13 say that Tom and I have worked together here since
14 we were young. And I appreciate our friendship
15 and the fact that also we were alums from the same
16 college and so it was fun and interesting to talk
17 to Tom very often.

18 And with Commissioner Graddy, he's been
19 very interesting, a very unique approach to
20 things. He's a great gentleman.

21 So is Tom.

22 But so I just wanted to thank you both for
23 your input and your commitment to doing the right
24 thing for our consumers and our employees.

25 COMMISSIONER KOLODZIEJ: Madam President,

1 I need to also go on the record.

2 To me this has been one of my most
3 pleasurable years because I think we have all
4 focused on doing the right thing. The chairs of
5 the various committees, personnel, in my opinion,
6 this is the best personal committee we've had.
7 And I've been here kind of a long time. And I
8 like Commissioner DeVita because he takes all the
9 hard committees, so I'm going to be really mad at
10 him for retiring because if there's a chance I'm
11 going to have to fill his shoes I'm going to be
12 calling you on a regular basis just to keep me
13 focused. So thank you for your commitment to this
14 Commission, our employees, and our ratepayers.
15 But most of all, for your integrity and desire to
16 do the right thing, both of you.

17 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: May I?

18 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: Yes, you may.

19 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: I think I've learned
20 a lot over the years here. It's been fun working
21 with everybody. I learned a lot with all of you.
22 I learned this year how to spell "Mazel Tov". I
23 learned I can understand Rigo now. I know how to
24 spell "Kolodziej" finally. But it's fun. I
25 finally learned how to pronounce Yaacov's name.

1 But it was fun. I enjoyed it. I thank you.

2 Russell, it's been a pleasure. We'll see
3 each other again.

4 Thank you, all.

5 MR. HANLEY: I just wanted to say that Tom
6 and I, like most lawyers, have had a few
7 differences from time to time, but I think we
8 developed a very good, professional relationship.

9 COMMISSIONER DeVITA: In my next life I
10 want to be you.

11 MR. HANLEY: But he's the one retiring.

12 But, anyway, and Commissioner Graddy, and
13 all the Commissioners because I've been on your
14 side of the table many times too and I know that
15 you're doing an awful lot, spending an awful lot
16 of your personal time, you get some compensation,
17 fifty cents an hour and you get a lot of the heat,
18 the heat that we don't get as the staff.

19 So, anyway, and I represented many, many
20 public entities and non-public entities and I have
21 to tell you I think this is one of the better ones
22 that I've ever experienced notwithstanding our
23 awards and our flaws. So I enjoyed.

24 MR. AMODIO: I'd also like to thank the
25 Commissioners as well.

1 Commissioner DeVita has helped me when I
2 first took this position a lot. There was a lot
3 of good advice that he gave me, how to handle
4 myself and how to handle things and I appreciate
5 that, Tom, I really do.

6 And Commissioner Graddy, it's been a
7 pleasure. I can't golf as good as you. But maybe
8 one day I can hit the ball straight.

9 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: I'd like to say, I
10 call him "Mr. G." You guys call him "Mr. Graddy,"
11 I call him "Mr. G." This is not the first time
12 that we've served together, but I always walk away
13 with a wealth of knowledge from him. He is a very
14 quiet, soft spoken man but he speaks with a lot of
15 knowledge and power. And I appreciate you setting
16 those footsteps for me to walk into, to follow.
17 And I appreciate the conversations that we've had.
18 I thank you for being a role model for me and I
19 know we can eat, so...

20 COMMISSIONER GRADDY: I appreciate that so
21 much.

22 PRESIDENT CLEAVES: So if all hearts and
23 minds are clear, meeting is adjourned.

24 MR. AMODIO: Time is 2:15.

25 (Proceedings concluded)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, LYNANN DRAGONE, License No. XIO1388, a
Certified Court Reporter and Notary Public of the State
of New Jersey, certify that the foregoing is a true and
accurate transcript of the hearing at the time and the
date hereinbefore set forth.

I further certify that I am neither attorney
nor Counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the
parties to the action in which this hearing was taken.

I further certify that I am not a relative or
employee of anyone employed in this case, nor am I
financially interested in this action.

LYNANN DRAGONE, CCR
Certified Court Reporter